

SHEFFIELD CONSERVATION ADVISORY GROUP

Meeting held 21st July, 2015

<u>PRESENT:</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Organisation</u>
	Dr. Philip Booth (Chair)	Co-opted Member
	Mr. Patrick Burns	Co-opted Member
	Mr. Howard Greaves	Hallamshire Historic Buildings Society
	Mr. Graham Hague	Victorian Society/South Yorkshire Industrial History Society
	Dr. Roger Harper	Ancient Monuments Society
	Dr. Jo Lintonbon	University of Sheffield
	Mr. Philip Moore	Sheffield Society of Architects

.....

1. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Mr. Rob Darrington (Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors), Mr. Rod Flint (Georgian Group), Mr. Tim Hale (Sheffield Chamber of Commerce), Mr. Bob Hawkins (Council for the Protection of Rural England), Mr. Bob Marshall (Royal Town Planning Institute), Mr. Andrew Shepherd (Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings) and Dr. Jan Woudstra (Landscape Institute)

2. **CHAIR'S REPORT**

The Chair reported that:-

- (a) Mr. Simon Chad and Mr. Simon Geddy were working on the arrangements for a joint walk by representatives of the Group and the Society of Architects, on dates between 11th and 14th August next, to assess the potential effects of possible developments on local heritage assets, within the City; and
- (b) John Stonard, Head of Urban Design and Conservation had requested that the minutes of the Group be produced more promptly .

The Group (i) noted the information and that efforts would be made to produce the minutes more promptly than had been the case with the last set of minutes and (ii) requested that details of the walks be circulated to Members as soon as possible.

3. **MINUTES**

The minutes of the meeting held on 19st May, 2015 were approved as a correct record, subject to the substitution in item 7(a) of the words "1950s extension" instead of the words "1990s extension" and, arising therefrom, the Group noted that:-

- (a) it was possibly the case that the tarmac which had been laid on areas of Fargate, following repairs to the footway would be there for longer than a

temporary period; and

(b) works of repair at Leah's Yard had been delayed, due to the discovery of bats at the site;

(c) planning permission had been granted for the development at Steel City House, with a reduction of one storey in its height;

(d) the Endcliffe Methodist Church had been bought by another denomination and would be used as a church. The Hallamshire Historic Buildings Society would pursue the matter of applying for its listing;

(e) enforcement action by an urgent works notice would be taken in respect of Old May House;

(f) Walkley Library was probably the only "Andrew Carnegie" library still in use within the City;

(g) number 165 Springfield Road had been designed by Sydney Shepherd of Shepherd, Fowler and Robinson, Architects and had been occupied by him for approximately ten years during the 1940s. There was a proposed development of an extension on the site. Mr Greaves would pursue the possibility of the building being listed;

(h) Etruria House had been built in the 1850s and had been extended in the 1860s. There was a proposal to convert it to two dwellings; and

(i) the extension to Abbeydale Grange had almost been completed but the windows, although built in stone, were different from those of the Grange.

4. **HEAD OF PLANNING'S REPORT**

The Head of Planning reported that :-

(a) the cottages and barn adjacent to Norwood Grange, at the Northern General Hospital, had been listed and the former children's home was being assessed. However, the application had been refused for listing of the water tower. Mr Greaves would appeal against that decision. The only other comparable water tower within South Yorkshire was at Doncaster Railway Station;

(b) the application for a development at Attercliffe Chapel had been withdrawn because the appropriate archaeological investigations had not been carried out;

(c) the City Council had won an appeal regarding the removal of high-level televisions, at Sheffield Railway Station; and

(d) the Institute of Historic Buildings and Conservation was going to carry out a review of decisions by planning inspectors at planning appeals, especially where it appeared that they were not appropriately qualified. It was felt that decisions affecting several local buildings, including the Attercliffe Sawmill would be considered..

The Group noted the information and congratulated the City Council, on the successful outcome of its appeal regarding Sheffield Station.

5. **SHEFFIELD SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND DESIGN PANEL**

The Group noted that, currently, there was no scheduled meeting of the Sheffield

Sustainable Development and Design Panel.

6. **HERITAGE ASSETS**

The Group considered the following applications for planning permission for development affecting Heritage Assets and made the observations stated:-

(a) Conversion and extensions to existing buildings and new link building to create 13 apartments and associated car parking and landscaping at former Grenoside Primary School, Norfolk Hill (Case No. 15/01967/FUL)

The Group welcomed the proposed reuse of the building. The Group felt that it made no sense to link such diverse buildings and if there was to be any extension, it should be a modest one to the lower status Infant School building, rather than to the main building, as this would not impinge on Lump Lane. The Group considered that the architectural treatment was unacceptable, the language was cluttered and something simpler was called for.

(b) Alterations and extensions to building including two-storey front/side/rear extensions to create mixed use development comprising bar/cafe, office accommodation and 6 apartments with associated car parking and landscaping, at W.A.Tyzack and Co. Ltd, Green Lane Works, Shalesmoor (Case Number:15/01781/LBC & 15/01780/FUL)

The Group felt that there was no objection to the principle of development at the site, but the method was key in view of the potential effect on the gateway building, which was a building of exceptional quality and importance to the area and the City. The Group considered that there was a lack of integrated design and no integration with the landscape and the right hand extension building. The Group felt that the right hand extension did not follow the line of Green Lane and competed with the gateway rather than complementing it. The Group considered that the Clock Tower was highly charged and that something of that language should be incorporated in a development which was of more solid material than glazing, to acknowledge the gateway. The Group felt that the use of brick rather than stone should be considered. The Group considered that there was a historical basis to extension on the site, but the development should repeat the layout of the 1850s map and the proposed treatment was inadequate.

(c) Demolition of existing building and erection of seven storey building to create 50 student apartments, with ancillary gymnasium, bike store and communal areas at Birch Hall, 87 Trippet Lane (Case No.15/02370/FUL) (amended resubmission of previously withdrawn application 15/01036/FUL)

The Group felt that the development was too high considering the streetscape of Trippet Lane, which was an ancient street and older than West Street. The Group considered there was no objection, in principle, to the demolition but the scale of the proposed replacement was excessive on both sides and eight storeys was too high. The Group observed that the submitted information was inadequate to judge the quality of the buildings, cross-sections should be provided and the

topography of Trippet Lane to West Street needed to be brought into the consideration.

(d) Demolition of former horse sick bay at Old Nunnery Station Bernard Road (Case Number: 15/01012/LBC)

The Group considered that consent should be refused. The Group urged the City Council to take enforcement action to protect a rare and individually listed building. The Group felt that there was no justification for its demolition and it was not a building that could be re-used.

7. MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS

- (a) the Pye Bank Road School, Pitsmoor was to be retained and a new school would be built adjacent to it;
- (b) Tapton Court, Shore Lane, had been restored following a fire. It had a new roof and was now in better condition than it had been in before the fire;
- (c) the Head of Planning (i) was investigating what was the reason for erecting scaffolding at the range on Well Meadow Street and (ii) would investigate the erection of signs on the gable and on the front of a building at Wharf Street;
- (d) number 10 Rushley Road was for sale;
- (e) Mr Hague and Valerie Bayliss were leading a walk from Angel Street on 26th July next, which was an activity organised for Environment Week;
- (f) Mr Greaves had contacted Mr. Albert Kirton, to obtain his help in securing the listing of buildings at the Northern General Hospital but unfortunately Mr. Kirton, who is now blind, was unable to do so;
- (g) Mr Greaves had received no response to his letter to the Co-Operative, regarding Cow Mouth Farm and the matter was now going to the press;
- (h) there had been a film festival, on 16th-17 July last, at the former Abbeydale Picture House and the interior of the property was more attractive, following alterations; and
- (i) a building at Malinda Street was going to auction and negotiations were taking place in connection with a building at Doncaster Street.

(NOTE: these minutes are subject to amendment at a future meeting)

This page is intentionally left blank